

X3.0 (duality) Prove the duality laws on page 241:

$$\neg \forall v. b = \exists v. \neg b$$

$$\neg \exists v. b = \forall v. \neg b$$

from the quantifier axioms on page 240:

$$(0) \quad \forall v. \text{null} \cdot b = \top$$

$$(1) \quad \forall v. x \cdot b = \langle v: x \cdot b \rangle x$$

$$(2) \quad \forall v. A, B \cdot b = (\forall v. A \cdot b) \wedge (\forall v. B \cdot b)$$

$$(3) \quad \forall v. (\S v: D \cdot b) \cdot c = \forall v. D \cdot b \Rightarrow c$$

$$(4) \quad \exists v. \text{null} \cdot b = \perp$$

$$(5) \quad \exists v. x \cdot b = \langle v: x \cdot b \rangle x$$

$$(6) \quad \exists v. A, B \cdot b = (\exists v. A \cdot b) \vee (\exists v. B \cdot b)$$

$$(7) \quad \exists v. (\S v: D \cdot b) \cdot c = \exists v. D \cdot b \wedge c$$

After trying the question, scroll down to the solution.

§

I'll prove

$$\neg \forall v: D \cdot b = \exists v: D \cdot \neg b$$

by structural induction on the structure of the domain  $D$ . The ways of forming a domain are:  $D = null$ ,  $D = x$  (an element),  $D = A, B$  (a union), and  $D = \S v: E \cdot c$  (a comprehension). A domain formed as an intersection can also be formed as a comprehension:  $A \cdot B = \S v: A \cdot v: B$ .

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \forall v: null \cdot b && \text{use (0)} \\ = & \neg \top \\ = & \perp && \text{use (4)} \\ = & \exists v: null \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \forall v: x \cdot b && \text{use (1)} \\ = & \neg \langle v: x \cdot b \rangle x && \text{this line is: } \neg(b \text{ but replace } v \text{ by } x) \\ = & \langle v: x \cdot \neg b \rangle x && \text{this line is: } (\neg b \text{ but replace } v \text{ by } x); \text{ now use (5)} \\ = & \exists v: x \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \forall v: A, B \cdot b && \text{use (2)} \\ = & \neg((\forall v: A \cdot b) \wedge (\forall v: B \cdot b)) && \text{now apply the basic de Morgan} \\ = & \neg(\forall v: A \cdot b) \vee \neg(\forall v: B \cdot b) && \text{now a structural induction step, twice} \\ = & (\exists v: A \cdot \neg b) \vee (\exists v: B \cdot \neg b) && \text{use (6)} \\ = & \exists v: A, B \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \forall v: (\S v: E \cdot c) \cdot b && \text{use (3)} \\ = & \neg(\forall v: E \cdot c \Rightarrow b) && \text{now a structural induction step} \\ = & \exists v: E \cdot \neg(c \Rightarrow b) && \text{some binary algebra} \\ = & \exists v: E \cdot c \wedge \neg b && \text{use (7)} \\ = & \exists v: (\S v: E \cdot c) \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$

And the other duality law

$$\neg \exists v: D \cdot b = \forall v: D \cdot \neg b$$

can be proven similarly. Or we can prove it from the one we just proved.

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \exists v: D \cdot b && \text{double negation} \\ = & \neg \exists v: D \cdot \neg \neg b && \text{use what we just proved} \\ = & \neg \neg \forall v: D \cdot \neg b && \text{double negation} \\ = & \forall v: D \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$